



A Report of: Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Annual Report 2019 – 2020

October 2020



City and County of Cardiff

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP



Councillor Ramesh Patel
(Chairperson)



Councillor Bob Derbyshire



Councillor Owen Jones



Councillor John Lancaster



Councillor Oliver Owen



Councillor Thomas Parkhill



Councillor Jacqueline Parry



Councillor Peter Wong



Councillor Ashley Wood

Note: Councillor Joe Boyle was a Member of this Committee until November 2019.

CHAIR'S FOREWORD

Without doubt, 2020 has been the most challenging year that I can remember. Freakish weather in January and February was followed by the Covid pandemic that swept the globe, and brought almost every aspect of life to a standstill. On the 23rd March the United Kingdom was placed into an unprecedented national lockdown, and the Council was forced to prioritise and adapt to ensure that Cardiff residents continued to receive essential core services. This also meant that the Environmental Scrutiny Committee programme for 2019/20 came to an abrupt end in March 2020.

At the beginning of the municipal year, the Committee planned a full and varied programme of work, and for the period to March 2020 it managed to scrutinise a number of key topics. In doing this the Committee held 11 public meetings; produced and submitted 14 letters to the Cabinet; concluded two significant task & finish exercises; engaged with key internal and external stakeholders; and delivered on its public engagement commitments. The majority of meetings were webcast during this year, and attracted 375 viewers.

Overall the Committee scrutinised 23 individual items, and some of the more important of these are listed below:

- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements **(12th June 2019)**
- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy **(2nd July 2019)**
- Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report **(17th September 2019)**
- Cardiff's Transport White Paper **(21st January 2020)**
- Receiving the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' **(21st January 2020)**
- Considering the Draft Budget Proposals for 2020/21 **(17th February 2020)**
- Receiving the Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' **(March 3rd 2020)**

To my mind, probably the most important piece of work delivered by the Committee in the year was the task & finish exercise on Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment. The report was concluded in November, and explored a range of areas including:

- The development of Cardiff's Biodiversity Forward Plan;
- The Council's current role, obligations and statutory / legislative requirements for supporting and improving biodiversity;
- The importance of Cardiff's biodiversity and ecosystems;
- The resources available to support and improve biodiversity in Cardiff;
- Cardiff's Green Infrastructure Strategy.

The inquiry consisted of eight task group meetings that supported fourteen separate witness sessions; dealt with 22 witnesses and made a series of theme based recommendations that included:

- Asking the Council to declare a biodiversity emergency to sit alongside the climate change emergency;
- A request to employ an additional Ecologist or Section 6 Officer to help ensure that the Council meets the requirements of the Section 6 Duty;
- To limit the use of pesticides such as glyphosate across the Council estate;
- For the Council to build a biodiversity well-being commitment into Capital Ambition, decision-making processes, business plans and policies;
- That the Council should deliver a series of actions to improve connectivity of habitat across Cardiff;
- For the Council to create and publish a community growing policy;
- That the Council should work with Elected Members, partner organisations, volunteer groups and the public to develop a 'Plant a Tree Scheme'.

I look forward to receiving the Cabinet response to this report in the coming months, and hope that it will help to make Cardiff a greener and more biodiverse city.

To conclude my foreword I would like to thank all of the Members of the Committee, the Cabinet, external witnesses and officers who have supported our work. In particular, it has been a pleasure to work with an excellent group of Councillors who have actively engaged in their roles at every single meeting. I look forward to your continued support, and a return to some kind of normality in the year to come.



Councillor Ramesh Patel

Chairperson - Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee

INTRODUCTION

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee plays an important role in assessing service performance and informing service policy development across a range of Council services, including all aspects of transport, sustainability, and waste.

This report presents the Committee's main activities during 2019/20. Between June 2019 and May 2020 the Committee scrutinised the following topics:

- **Briefing Information** – Where the Committee receives information on a specific subject that has environmental implications to the Council and the city. During 2019/20 examples included:
 - Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (**1st October 2019**)
 - Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (**1st October 2019**)
 - Informal Waste Management Briefing (**5th November 2019**)
 - National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note (**20th November 2019**)
 - Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (**20th November 2020**)
 - Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (**3rd March 2020**)
 - Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (**3rd March 2020**)
- **Inquiries** – Where the Committee had undertaken an examination of a topic over a period of time, resulting in a formal report to the Cabinet. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Draft Task & Finish Report – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff (**20th November 2019**)

- Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' (**21st January 2020**)
- Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' (**March 3rd 2020**)
- **Performance Monitoring** – Where the Committee has undertaken monitoring of the Council's performance. During 2018/19 examples included:
 - Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (**17th September 2019**)
 - Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (**1st October 2019**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
 - Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 (**3rd March 2020**)
 - Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (**20th November 2020**)
- **Policy Review** - Where the Committee has contributed to the Council's policy development processes, for example, by considering draft policy documents, and/or where the Committee has considered the implementation of policies, looking at whether this has happened in a timely manner and the impact of the policy, giving the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views about whether any changes are required.
- **Pre Decision Scrutiny** – This provides the Committee with an opportunity to evaluate and comment on policy proposals before they go to the Council's Cabinet. This gives the Cabinet the opportunity to know Scrutiny Members' views prior to making their decision. During 2019/20 examples included:

- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements (**12th June 2019**)
- Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy (**2nd July 2019**)
- Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – (**17th September 2019**)
- Cardiff's Transport White Paper (**21st January 2020**)
- Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance – (**21st January 2020**)
- Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 – Corporate Overview (**17th February 2020**)
- Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 & 2020/21 Draft Budget Proposals (**17th February 2020**)

Over the year the Scrutiny Committee held **11** committee meetings and wrote **14** letters to the Cabinet sharing their comments/ recommendations and concerns following the scrutiny of items at committee meetings. The majority of meetings were webcast during this year and attracted 375 viewers.

Members have attended a number of other scrutiny events, including work programming meetings, and pre-meetings prior to Committee and task & finish group meetings.

BRIEFING INFORMATION

Highway Resurfacing Programme – Member Briefing Note (1st October 2019)

The meeting on 1st October 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Highway Resurfacing Programme for 2019/20. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the draft 'Highways Resurfacing Programme', considering the sections on:

- Draft Resurfacing Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Reconstruction Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Micro Sites – 2019/20
- Draft Grouted Macadam Sites – 2019/20

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update (1st October 2019)

The meeting on 1st October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's District Heat Network – Member Update'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to assess the progress that has been made towards establishing Cardiff's District Heat Network; in particular to consider how close the Council was to agreeing a final business case and the necessary procurement arrangements required to deliver the scheme. Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member that included the following points:

- Members viewed it as a very positive scheme for the Council that would make a significant contribution in reducing Cardiff's carbon footprint, and thanked the officers for their hard work.
- Members asked for clarification on the potential financial risks facing the Council from the District Heat Network; asked for confirmation of the point at which the scheme would become financially unviable for the Council; and requested details of the financial monitoring process.

Informal Waste Management Briefing (5th November 2019)

The meeting on 5th November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to receive a private briefing from the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and supporting officers on recent developments in the Recycling & Waste Management Service. The meeting was held jointly with the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee, and was structured to consider:

- The performance of Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- The challenges & opportunities facing Cardiff's Waste Management Service.
- Future proposals relevant to Cardiff's Waste Management Service.

The contents and findings arising from the meeting will be used to identify topics for future scrutiny and potential task & finish work.

National Development Framework – Member Briefing Note – (20th November 2019)

The meeting on the 20th November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to discuss and comment on the Cabinet response to the Welsh Government's National Development Framework 2020-2040.

The National Development Framework (NDF) is a new development plan which will set the direction for development in Wales from 2020 to 2040. At the time it was being prepared by the Welsh Government and represented the highest tier of statutory development plans in Wales. It was designed to provide a framework to be built upon by the Strategic Development Plans (SDPs) at a regional level, and Local Development Plans (LDPs) at a local authority level.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan – Member Briefing Note (20th November 2019)

The meeting on 20th November 2019 provided the Environmental Scrutiny Committee with the opportunity to comment on the Public Rights of Way Improvement Plan. Members were able to reflect upon the content of the Cabinet report titled 'Rights of Way Improvement Plan (ROWIP) 2020-30' that was due to be presented at the Cabinet meeting on the 21st November 2019. The key sections of the new plan included:

- **Section 1** - providing an introduction and background to the ROWIP and the Cardiff Public Rights of Way (PROW) network;
- **Section 2** – providing the reasons for making a new ROWIP for 2020-30.
- **Section 3** – providing details of the New Assessment, which looks at 3 main points: Reviewing ROWIP 1: 2008-18; Evaluating the current network; and, Evaluating the public's future needs and opportunities of the network.
- **Section 4** - outlining the Statement of Action for ROWIP 2020-30, which has 5 Key Strategies for the long term aims over the 10-year period as listed below. **Section 5** - The Key Aims provided a detailed plan of the Council's priorities over the next 10 years.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report.

Member Briefing Note: Fireworks (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Fireworks'. Members were able to discuss a range of firework related challenges, including:

- Firework safety issues;
- Firework Code;
- Fireworks Law in the United Kingdom;
- Fireworks Available to the Public;
- Restrictions on sale & use;
- A range of RSPCA Proposals;
- House of Commons Petitions Committee Fireworks Report.

Members were asked to note the content of the item and discuss any future actions relating to the report. At the end of the meeting the Committee agreed to monitor the problem, and consider adding it to their work programme in future.

Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019 (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Member Briefing Note: Cardiff Local Development Plan Full Review – Consideration of Proposed Amendments Tabled at Council Meeting of 28th November 2019'. During this item Members were able to discuss the reasons for the Cabinet the report, and the following proposed amendments:

- ***Amendment 1:*** Council agrees as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will introduce Green Belt(s) in areas of Cardiff.
- ***Amendment 2:*** Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that there is proper public transport easily accessible for residents of all new developments and in place at an early stage.
- ***Amendment 3:*** Council agrees that as part of the full review of the Local Development Plan, Cardiff Council will ensure that the design of new developments will be relevant to the local area and of the highest quality achievable.

In addition to this, Members received a briefing on the next steps for Cardiff's Local Development Plan and were asked to note the contents of the paper.

INQUIRIES

Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' – (21st January 2020)

The meeting on 21st January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality'. The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Strategic Planning & Transport; and Social Care, Health & Well-being attended the meeting and were supported by officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Positive Report Response** - The Committee was pleased by number of recommendations that had been accepted, and the overall positive response to the report. In particular, they welcomed the comments that were made by Councillor Wild during his opening statement that thanked the Committee for the piece of work and the valuable contribution that it made.
- **Recommendation 6 – Low Emission Neighbourhoods** – During the meeting Members questioned why Recommendation 6 had been rejected, when the draft 'Transport White Paper' had talked about similar initiatives being delivered across the city, for example, 'streets for health'. Councillor Wild explained that if the timing had been slightly different, and with some reflection, 'Recommendation 6' could have been accepted as it is something that aligns with the aims of the Transport White Paper. Members asked the Cabinet Members to revisit the recommendation and provide the Committee with feedback on the conclusion.
- **Bold Taxi Statement** - The first part of 'Recommendation 19' stated that:

- *The Council makes a clear statement that sets out the Council's ambitions for taxi emission standards in the city and explains out how this might be achieved, for example, Nottingham has stated that it wants to significantly reduce taxi emissions in the city by converting all of its taxi fleet to electric by 2025.*

Members felt that this had not been properly addressed in the Cabinet response, and asked if there were any proposals to publish a target date for improving taxi standards. The Committee emphasised that the Council needed to provide a positive statement to help drive taxi improvements, and asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response.

- **Local Motor Industry** - The Committee was disappointed at the response to 'Recommendations 23 & 24' which focused on developing closer working ties with the local motor industry. They felt that developing these relationships could only help increase the popularity of low emission vehicles, which would be a positive thing for Cardiff. The Committee asked the Cabinet Members to reconsider the response, and as a minimum ensure that all local car dealerships were aware of all of the electric charging points in Cardiff, including those provided by the Council.
- **Electric Charging Points** - At the meeting the Chair asked about the new electric charging points that had been rolled out across Cardiff, along with the rationale as to how and why the sites had been selected. The Committee asked for details of all of the new Council electric charging points and the information that was used to select the sites.

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff

During much of 2019/20 the Committee worked on an inquiry titled ‘Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff’. Scoping meetings took place in April 2019, and a terms of reference for the inquiry was agreed. This is set out below:

The aim of the inquiry is to provide Members with the opportunity to explore and consider how the Council can support and help improve the biodiversity in Cardiff. In particular this will include scrutiny of:

- *The development of Cardiff’s Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, its structure, aims and objectives;*
- *The ongoing implications of Cardiff’s Biodiversity Forward Plan, for example, future reporting and monitoring of the document;*
- *The approach taken by other Welsh local authorities to develop biodiversity forward plans and to identify best practice in this area;*
- *The Council’s current role, obligations and statutory / legislative requirements for supporting and improving biodiversity;*
- *The importance of Cardiff’s biodiversity and ecosystems;*
- *The resources available to support and improve biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *Community collaboration and other partnership working approaches to understand how they help support and enhance biodiversity in Cardiff;*
- *The importance of raising awareness of biodiversity issues in Cardiff – internally, with key stakeholders and the public;*
- *Cardiff’s Green Infrastructure Strategy – including the benefits of green infrastructure and ecosystem services;*
- *Green Infrastructure Management – including the Green Infrastructure Group;*

- *Cardiff Green Infrastructure SPG and Planned Development;*
- *The Green Infrastructure Spatial Strategy;*
- *Green Infrastructure Implementation Programme (Pollinators Action Plan, Individual Park Management Plans, Local Nature Plan, River Corridors, Tree Strategy, Cross border initiatives, other plans & projects);*
- *Sustainable drainage – links with the SuDS Approval Body process.*

The task & finish report was completed in November 2019, and in doing this the Committee undertook and delivered the following:

- 7 task group meetings;
- 15 separate witness sessions;
- Dealing with 22 witnesses (14 external to the Council);
- Worked closely with the Cabinet Members and Council staff who are responsible for managing biodiversity and the natural environment in Cardiff;
- Received witness contributions from a range of expert witnesses.

The draft task & finish report was approved at the Committee meeting on the 20th November, and then presented to Cabinet at their meeting on the 23rd January 2020. In concluding the task & finish exercise made a series of recommendations including the following:

- Asking the Council to declare a biodiversity emergency to sit alongside the climate change emergency;
- To employ an additional Ecologist or Section 6 Officer to help ensure that the Council meets the requirements of the Section 6 Duty;
- Where practically possible, to limit the use of pesticides such as glyphosate across the Council estate;
- The Council should build a biodiversity well-being commitment into Capital Ambition, decision-making processes, business plans and policies;
- The Council should link biodiversity and the resilience well-being objective into Cardiff's Local Development Plan when it is revised in 2020;

- The Council should deliver a series of actions to improve connectivity of habitat across Cardiff. This would help enhance biodiversity in the city;
- The Council should create and publish a community growing policy;
- The Council should work with Elected Members, partner organisations, volunteer groups and the public to develop a 'Plant a Tree Scheme'.

The Committee is due to receive a full Cabinet response to the task & finish report during 2020/21.

Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ – (March 3rd 2020)

The meeting on 3rd March gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Cabinet Response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ . The Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment attended the meeting and was supported by officers from the People & Communities Directorate. Details of the Cabinet response to the report were provided, and following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Enforcement Teams** – Members asked for further details of the proposed ‘Whole Council’ approach to litter enforcement which they were told would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the city. The Committee agreed to add it to the work programme for 2020/21.
- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, particularly for litter thrown from vehicles on key routes into and out of the city. They agreed to support any Welsh Government lobbying that the Council decided to undertake to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **Litter Action Plan** – During the meeting an officer explained that the full response to the report recommendations would be put into an action plan. The Committee look forward to receiving a copy of this document, and hope that it will deal with concerns that they had regarding the ‘partially accepted’ and ‘accepted in principle’ responses.
- **Cardiff App** – The Committee asked that all new Cardiff residents are automatically sent information on the app when registering for Council tax; this they felt would help increase the uptake of the app and in turn help improve the collection of litter and fly tipping data.

- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. Members asked for a progress update on the suggestion once it had been reviewed.
- **Recycling & Pop Up Bins** – Members were disappointed that the Council was not looking to roll out recycling and pop up bins to wards outside the city centre. They felt that using these type of bins would encourage better recycling habits, and asked the Cabinet Member to reconsider how these are allocated across Cardiff.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered. The Committee asked that they were kept informed on any developments, and agreed to carry out scrutiny on any new proposals that are brought forward.

PERFORMANCE MONITORING

Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report (17th September 2019)

The meeting on the 17th September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide a short briefing to Members on the content of a Cabinet report titled 'Third Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report' that was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 26th September 2019. In addition to this, Members were able to ask any questions that they had on the delivery of the Cardiff's Local Development Plan.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- Members were concerned that measures contained within the Annual Monitoring Report suggested that in the last three years the level of physical activity had declined. They asked what the point of the Local Development Plan was if people weren't getting healthier, and asked for an explanation on how the Local Development Plan could be used to reverse this trend.
- Members were concerned that only 40% of the housing completions set out against the Local Development Plan had been achieved, and that only 25% of the affordable housing allocation has been completed creating a 15% lag between the two targets. This was a particular concern because 75% of the affordable housing target needed to be delivered in less than seven years. The Committee asked for assurance that progress would be

made in the next few years to significantly increase the number of affordable properties in Cardiff.

- The Annual Monitoring Report showed a gradual decline in the number of sustainable travel journeys for education, stating that trips for '*education has seen a significant decrease*'. Members felt that this was a concern since school traffic was significantly adding to congestion in Cardiff at the beginning and end of every school day, and so what the Council proposed to do to reverse the trend and increase the number of sustainable journeys to and from school.

- During the meeting there was some debate around planning decisions for student accommodation in the city. Some Members questioned the temporary change of use planning status that had been applied for and granted on some student developments in Cardiff – this meant that, on a temporary basis, the accommodation could now be occupied by other residents, i.e. not students. They were concerned that a precedent had been set, meaning that other developers could follow suit should their developments fail to attract sufficient numbers of students. Members felt that this presented risks in terms of building standards and receipt of planning obligation monies. The Committee went on to question the level of demand for student accommodation in Cardiff, particularly as the Annual Monitoring Report states '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'. A Member cited a recent Savills report which provided an opposite view. The Committee asked for a copy of the evidence used to support the claim that '*current evidence shows the further strength of the student accommodation market in Cardiff*'.

- The Committee welcomed the positive cycling results that were included in the Annual Monitoring Report, however, they were concerned that congestion levels continue to increase across the city (for example, from 27% in 2017 to 28% by 2018). They felt that reducing congestion levels in Cardiff should be one of the fundamental principles of the Local Development Plan, and agreed to monitor the progress made in this area.

Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20 (1st October 2019)

The meeting on the 1st October 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Quarterly Performance Monitoring – Quarters 1 & 2, 2019/20'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment, the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and Peoples & Communities Directorates.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Members for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

The Committee was concerned that Cardiff would not achieve the Welsh Government recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. The 2018/19 outturn result for the recycling indicator was 59.3%, which meant that the city had to achieve a 4.7% increase in one year. Members felt that achieving such a large increase would require a significant change to Cardiff's waste collection approach, and that currently no such proposals exist. Swansea City Council, a comparable Welsh local authority, achieved 63% recycling during 2018/19 – this meant that it only had to achieve a 1% improvement in 2019/20. Members felt that the Council should look at how Swansea had achieved 63% recycling, and then analyse the reasons for the 3.7% difference. Understanding the differences between the results of the two comparable local authorities should provide Cardiff with some of the answers that it needs.

- The Committee was concerned by the very high sickness rates in the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. At the end of Quarter 3 the Directorate was anticipating 17.6 FTE sick days per employee for 2018/19. Officers explained that they were committed to reducing the current sickness levels, but that they had to work within the existing Council sickness policy. Members accepted this, however, felt that something had to change as sickness was having an impact on budgets

and service delivery. The Committee asked for clarification on the following:

- **Return to Work Interviews** – the Directorate was completing return to work interviews in 98% of reported sickness cases. This was a very high figure and suggested that managers were working hard to follow the Council’s sickness policy. Unfortunately sickness rates had continued to rise, suggesting that the policy was not be working effectively in parts of the Council. Members asked for confirmation if there were any plans in place to review the effectiveness of the policy.
- **Overspend Costs** – the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was overspent by £1.265 million in 2018/19. The biggest contributor to this deficit was the Recycling & Waste Management Service with an overspend of £2.947 million. Members asked for confirmation on how much of the overspend could be directly attributed to high sickness rates, for example, the ‘back filling’ of posts due to sickness.
- **Increasing Sickness Rates** – Members noted that sickness rates had continually increased for a number of years; this was having an impact on budgets and service delivery. Reversing this change required strategic planning and leadership from the Council’s Senior Management Team. The Committee asked for a summary of the proposals that the Head of Paid Service and the Senior Management Team had put forward to stem this increase and ultimately reduce sickness levels in the Directorate and across the wider Council.
- A Member asked about plans for a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in the north of Cardiff, and was told that at present the Council had been unable to identify a suitable site. The Committee asked for a list of potential sites that have been identified, and the reasons why these had been deemed unsuitable, along with assurance that the search for a new site would continue.

- Members feel that they need some clarity on the conflicting sustainable travel data that had been provided to the Committee. For example, sustainable travels seems to be increasing, but at the same time journeys by bus and train are declining. In addition to this congestion had been increasing while modal shift targets appeared to have changed. To help address this the Committee asked for a list of all the transport performance indicators being used by the Council, to include details of how these are defined, how they are measured, and the results for the last three years.

- Some Members expressed concern at the reducing number of sustainable journeys to and from school in Cardiff. This was a worry because school traffic made a significant contribution to congestion twice a day; reduced active travel, and failed to create a sustainable travel mind-set in young people. The Committee suggested that the Council should look at transport to schools again, and review its approach to bus provision.

- At the meeting it was noted that the Highways Service had an underspend of £1.124 million in 2018/19, and that this saving had helped to reduce the wider Directorate overspend to £1.265 million. The Committee was advised during Budget Scrutiny that the total projected Highway budget for 2018/19 (capital and revenue) was £5.804 million, and so were concerned that that a £1.124 million underspend (approximately 19% of the total budget) had been achieved in an area that is consistently considered a citizen priority. They felt that such a saving was short sighted, as the Highway Asset requires sustained investment to ensure that the speed of deterioration does not increase. They asked the Cabinet Member to:
 - Confirm from which part(s) of the Highways budget the savings were achieved;
 - Explain how the decision was taken to allow an underspend against this budget;
 - Provide details of any consultation that was undertaken around taking this saving;
 - Provide the Committee with assurance that this underspend has not contributed to any unnecessary deterioration of the Highway Asset.

Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update (20th November 2019)

The meeting on the 20th November 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Shared Regulatory Services – Four Year Progress Update'. The item was supported by Councillor Michael Michael - Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; Councillor Lynda Thorne - Cabinet Member for Housing & Communities and Councillor Norma Mackie, Chair of Cardiff's Licensing & Public Protection Committee. They will be supported by officers from Shared Regulatory Services and the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. In addition to this, representatives from the Wales Audit Office were in attendance to discuss the content of the report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'. The purposed of the report was to:

- **Four Year Progress Update:** Consider the performance of Shared Regulatory Services since it was established in May 2015;
- **Annual Report 2018/19:** Consider the Shared Regulatory Services Annual Report 2018/19; and,
- **Wales Audit Office Report:** To consider the findings and actions falling out of the recent Wales Audit Office report titled 'Delivering with Less – Environmental Health Services'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Taxi Marshals** – Members sought clarification on the number of taxi marshals operating in the city centre, the hours that they worked and details of who held responsibility for managing the staff.
- **HMO Licensing Scheme** – Members acknowledge the success of the HMO licensing scheme in Cathays and Plasnewydd and encouraged the Council to expand the geographical range of the policy to other parts of the city.

- **High Rise Buildings & Fire Safety** – At the meeting an officer commented on the proportionately high number of high-rise buildings in Cardiff that had recently failed fire safety tests. This had created a significant safety issue and placed many residents in a very challenging financial position. Members were concerned by this and referred the item to the Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee.
- **Shared Regulatory Services – Statutory Obligations** – Members asked for confirmation that the Shared Regulatory Services was delivering against all of the Council’s statutory obligations, and to provide supporting evidence to verify that this was the case.
- **Enforcement Action Income** – At the meeting it was acknowledged that taking enforcement action through Shared Regulatory Services was a costly exercise, and that even when successful, neither the Council or Shared Regulatory Services was entitled to keep the cost of the fine. Members felt that the value of the fines should be passed back to the Council or Shared Regulatory Services and reinvested back into frontline service delivery, and recommended that the Council lobby the Welsh Government to ask that the fine money is passed back to local authorities in future.

Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19 – (3rd March 2020)

The meeting on the 3rd March 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarter 3 & Outturn Performance Reports 2018/19'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment and People & Communities Directorates. The purpose of the report was to review the performance reports relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee for Quarter 1 (April to June 2019) and Quarter 2 (July to September 2019).

Following discussion, questions and comments, the Committee sent letters to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **Recycling Target Fines** – It was apparent that the Council would not achieve the Welsh Government Recycling target of 64% during 2019/20. Member asked for confirmation on, i) the value of the potential fine that the Welsh Government could be levied against the Council for failing to reach the target; ii) details of the work and dialogue that the Council was undertaking with Welsh Government to avoid the fines being applied; iii) examples of local authorities who missed the recycling target in 2018/19.
- **LEAMS DATA** – A Member asked for an explanation as to why Quarter 1 (96.54%) produced a better score for the indicator described as '*the percentage of highways and relevant land inspected of a high or acceptable standard of cleanliness*' than Quarter 3 (94.32%), as in his experience Quarter 1 was always worse for litter than Quarter 3.
- **Enforcement Teams** – A Member asked for details of what the proposed 'Whole Council' approach to litter enforcement entailed. He was told that it would involve better use of a wide range of Council resources across the

city, and that they were hoping for Cabinet support to fund the proposals in the summer. The Committee asked for more information on the scheduled changes and agreed to add proposals to the future work programme.

- **Camera Powers** – Members were supportive of the use of cameras to target littering offences, and acknowledged that existing legislation wasn't strong enough. They recommended that the Council should lobby the Welsh Government to improve existing powers to enhance the use of cameras to target littering offences.
- **QR Codes for Bins** – During the meeting a Member suggested that placing QR codes on bins would be a cheap and effective way of monitoring the use of bins in the city. The Assistant Director for Street Scene thought that this was a good idea and confirmed that he would look into how it might work in Cardiff. The Committee asked for a progress update on the matter after it had been reviewed.
- **Four Day Working** – Members noted that the idea of four day working was being considered, and asked for regular updates and an opportunity to scrutinise any future proposals.
- **Funding for Active Travel Schemes** – Members asked for details on existing sums and current funding bids that are in place to support active travel for schools.

PRE DECISION SCRUTINY

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements (12th June 2019)

The meeting on the 12th June 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan - Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Social Care, Health & Well-being; Dr Porter from Public Health Wales; and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the meeting was to undertake pre decision scrutiny on a report titled 'Air Quality Feasibility Study Final Plan – Full Business Case & City Centre Transport Improvements', prior to it being received at the Cabinet meeting on the 13th June 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Members that included the following points:

- **Preferred Option Modelling** – At the start of the meeting there was some confusion around exactly what had been included in the modelling for the preferred option. For example, it was explained that the bus station would not be complete by the start of 2021 and, therefore, it had not been modelled into the overall scheme. This created some confusion since the new bus station was one of the main features on the map setting out the new City Centre Schemes. Members asked for clarification on which developments (for example the new bus station and BBC offices at Central Square) had been built into the modelling, and which assumptions had been used in terms of numbers of people and journey movements.
- **Castle Street & Westgate Street** – Members raised some concerns about how the air quality improvements would be achieved in Castle Street and Westgate Street, given that the existing traffic would still have to pass

through a narrower area. They suggested that a large volume of traffic would still try to access what is already a restricted area, which in turn would slow vehicles down and increase pollution. They were also concerned that some traffic would just be displaced to other parts of the city, resulting in the air quality problem just being moved. To respond to this Members asked for clarification on the following:

- If the preferred option (CASAP) reduces traffic into the city centre by 30%, given that the model only assumes a 3.5% modal shift where does the balance of the traffic go.
 - If a clear air zone (CAZ) had been introduced, by how much would traffic entering the city centre have been reduced? Also, please confirm where the traffic displaced by the CAZ would go.
- **Taxi Mitigation Schemes** – At the meeting Members were told that a proposed £1.86m had been allocated in the preferred option to support taxi mitigation schemes. An officer explained that the proposal would be available to taxi drivers who were registered in Cardiff and each application would be limited to a maximum contribution of £3,000 per driver. Members were also told that the £3,000 would be allocated to cover running costs and not a front loaded capital contribution to support the initial purchase of a low emission vehicle. The Committee was concerned by this as they believe that the main barrier to purchasing a low emission vehicle for most drivers is the initial cost of purchase and not the annual running cost. Members asked that the Cabinet review this approach and consider the option of providing the grant as a front loaded cost to assist with the actual purchase.
 - **Queen Street Cycling Options** – Members were very supportive of the introduction of more and better quality cycling lanes, however, they were not convinced by the ‘City Centre Loop’ that takes cyclists around the city centre via Boulevard De Nantes and Dumfries Place. The Committee felt that many cyclists who are looking to cross the city centre would ignore the

new loop and simply cycle across Queen Street instead. With this in mind Members asked:

- That the Council review reviews the option of allowing cycling on Queen Street;
 - For details of the consultation that had been carried out with cycling groups in developing this section of cycling infrastructure;
 - For details of the modelling used to assess the number of cyclists using this scheme;
 - If the Council had been able to draw any information or data from the introduction of the Nextbike scheme to help with the development of the proposals.
- **Clean Air Zone (CAZ) v Non Charging Zone (CASAP)** - During the way forward a Member asked if the comparison between the CASAP and CAZ was a fair one. He expanded this by asking why the CAZ had been modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieves compliance and that the government guidance states that '*a CAZ should only be implemented if non-charging alternatives don't achieve compliance*'. As a follow on to this the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to explain, i) if the comparison between the CAZ and CASAP was a fair one, and if so why this was the case; ii) why the CAZ was modelled at all, given that the CASAP achieved compliance.
 - **Taxis Registered in other local authority areas** – At the meeting Members commented on the large number of taxis that are registered by neighbouring local authority areas and are freely operating in Cardiff. Members understood that this was largely out of the control of the Council, and that a Welsh Government review of taxi services was ongoing – the hope was that this piece of work would standardise taxi licensing across Wales. In the letter the Committee asked the Cabinet Member to encourage the Welsh Government to complete its review of taxi services so that it does not undermine the challenge of achieving air quality compliance in Cardiff.

- **EV Infrastructure** - During the meeting a Member asked for details of the proposals for the provision of public EV charging infrastructure in the city. Members felt that charging infrastructure would encourage drivers to switch to lower emission vehicles; without such provision it would be difficult for the change to happen.
- **Mandatory Retrofitting of Buses** – The Committee was told that the preferred option assumed an 80% uptake of remaining non-Euro 6 buses to Euro 6. Some Members were of the view that mandatory retrofitting of buses should be set at 100%, assuming that the Council was agreeing to cover the cost (based on the £2.25million contribution). They believed that this would send out a clear message, and would be consistent with the proposed changes to taxi licensing standards.

Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy (2nd July 2019)

The meeting on the 2nd July 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Pre Decision Scrutiny: Cardiff Food Strategy'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purposed of the report was to consider the development of the Cardiff Food Strategy prior to it being received by Cabinet on the 26th September 2019.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- **Hydroponic Hub** – Members found the idea of a 'Hydroponic Hub' very interesting, particularly as such a venture could provide an opportunity for local residents to grow a range of produce out of season. Members acknowledged there was an established allotment community in Cardiff, and that many of these would welcome an out of season opportunity to grow food. On this basis the Committee recommended that if the Council did propose developing a 'Hydroponic Hub' then it should engage with the allotment community to establish interest and commitment to take the project forward.
- **Local Food Market** – Members feel that Cardiff has a strong local food community, but lacks a permanent base where the local food offer can be showcased. A Member pointed out that the city does not have an equivalent of Borough Market, and that such a facility would add sustainability, economic and tourism benefits. The Committee asked the Cabinet Member to look into the feasibility of developing such a venue in the city centre.
- **Local Food Quality Mark** - The Committee supported the idea of creating a local food quality mark for Cardiff. They felt that this could be introduced

to identify locally produced food that meets an agreed standard. It would help local food growers, support the local economy and incentivise sustainability.

- **Beef** - During the meeting a Member suggested that the Council should probably play a greater role in determining what was consumed at Council establishments and in school canteens. For example, beef, beef and beef had dominated the menu at his daughter's school for the last three days. He went on to highlight the current environmental crisis facing the planet, making reference to the negative impact that the beef industry has on large parts of the world. He continued by suggesting that the Council should use its influence in the procurement process to understand where our beef came from, for example, providing assurance that it was locally produced and not a product of Brazil where huge deforestation is taking place to enable production. He concluded by suggesting that the Council needed to be sure of the carbon footprint of the food that it procures and consumes. The Committee agreed with this suggestion and encouraged the Council to, i) do all it can to produce a greener menu that supports the Council's wider carbon reduction commitment; ii) encourage schools to do more to promote healthy eating on the curriculum, while at the same time promoting food sustainability.

Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision – (17th September 2019)

The meeting on the 17th September 2019 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Affordable Funeral Strategy & Burial Space Provision'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an overview of the national issue around the rising costs of funerals, and to consider Cardiff's Draft Affordable Funerals Strategy that seeks to inform the public of funeral costs and the options they have to procure an affordable and dignified funeral.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members congratulated the Cabinet Member and the staff in Bereavement & Registration Services for winning 'Best Service Team of the Year – Cemetery & Crematorium Category' at the APSE awards.
- During the meeting Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was looking into the development of some type of funeral plan or bond to help local residents to save for funeral expenses. The Committee asked for information on the type of plan or scheme that the Council was looking to deliver, along with an explanation of the potential barriers and benefits that various options might provide.
- The Committee was told that people are generally reluctant to talk about future funeral arrangements, and that avoiding such a conversation could make things difficult for those left to pick up the pieces and potentially channel families and individuals into funeral poverty. Members were told that Bereavement & Registration Services was due to start a 'Broader Conversations Campaign' that would provide 'pre-need advice' along with counselling and support for those struggling to manage the financial and

emotional difficulties that can accompany the planning of a funeral. The Committee welcomed the roll out of such a campaign, and asked for assurance that all staff providing the counselling and advice were properly trained.

- Members welcomed the news that the Council had identified an ashes scatter area along the River Taff, and asked for details of the exact location prior to any public announcement.

Cardiff's Transport White Paper (21st January 2020)

The meeting on the 21st January gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Cardiff's Transport White Paper'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport, officers from the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate; Mark Barry - Professor of Practice in Connectivity, Cardiff University and Stuart Cole CBE – Professor of Transport at the University of South Wales. The purpose of the report was to consider the content of the draft 'Transport White Paper: Transport Vision 2030', and to discuss the options for funding the delivery of the proposed transport infrastructure. The report was due to be presented to Cabinet on Thursday 23rd January 2020.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport that included the following points:

- **A Positive Transport Ambition** - Members were supportive of the proposed ten-year transport vision that is set out in the draft 'Transport White Paper'. They felt that if the combination of schemes contained within the document were delivered, then moving around Cardiff would become easier, air quality would improve and both carbon emissions from vehicles and congestion would reduce.
- **Cross City Connectivity** - The Committee was fully behind the proposals to improve connectivity across Cardiff. They believed that projects such as the Cardiff Crossrail Tram – Train Line, the Cardiff Circle Line and new cross-city bus network would address this longstanding problem.
- **Importance of Engaging with Bus Companies** – Improving bus provision in the city is a core aim of the draft 'Transport White Paper'. Indeed, section 2 of the document titled 'Bus Growth' is exclusively dedicated to improving bus travel into and around the city. During the meeting a Member commented on the importance of the bus as a mode of

transport in the draft 'Transport White Paper', and asked for details on how much engagement had happened with the various private bus companies who operate in the city. He was told that regular engagement had taken place with the private bus companies, however, much work still needed to happen to deliver the vision set out in the plan – for example, developing governance and partnership agreements. The Committee see that bus has a central place in Cardiff's transport plans, therefore, ask that you ensure that the Council works and fully engages with all of the private bus companies during every stage of the delivery of the plan.

- **Deliverability & Funding** - The Committee supported the ambition and vision contained within the draft 'Transport White Paper', whilst having a number of concerns on the deliverability and funding of the proposals. To ease concerns they asked:
 - For assurance that the 10 year vision was achievable, along with an explanation as to why this was the case.
 - That planning was underpinned by 'lessons learnt' from other major projects infrastructure and transport projects.
 - That the Council adhered to best practice throughout delivery.
 - That 'slippage' was built into the planning timeline and that the Council maintains a series of 'plan B' options to turn to should the worst happen.
 - That transport infrastructure needed to be in place before any charging takes place, and that any monies raised should be specifically ring-fenced for transport infrastructure.
 - An explanation on how the £1 bus journeys scheme would work, and provide detail of how it might be funded.

Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance (21st January 2020)

The meeting on the 21st January 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on an item titled 'Education Campaign to Support Improved Recycling Performance'. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment and officers from the People & Communities Directorate. The purpose of the report was to provide the Committee with an opportunity to consider the report due to be received by Cabinet on Thursday 23rd January and to review:

- The outline proposals for the new education campaign that would focus upon recycling performance;
- The draft strategy titled 'Working together to improve recycling for Cardiff'.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment that included the following points:

- Members welcome the introduction of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme, seeing it as a positive step forward that should help Cardiff make improvements on current recycling rates.
- The Committee felt that the Council could apply a similar 'Pink Sticker' approach to the municipal waste stream, i.e. a sticker that is used to identify municipal waste that includes material that can be recycled. They accepted the argument that such a change should not be introduced immediately as the public needed to adapt to the current proposal, however, they felt that this was something that the Council could look at in the future.
- Members were told that the Council was looking to enhance waste collection technology, for example, by potentially introducing RFID stickers to improve the quality and speed of data collection. The Committee welcomed this approach as it would improve the data held by the Council,

putting it in an informed position so that it can better target waste collection resources.

- The Committee felt that to maximise the impact of the 'Pink Sticker' scheme the Council waste webpage page needed to be as engaging and interactive as possible, therefore, they recommended that Recycling & Waste Management review the information on the site to identify how improvements could be made.
- A Member commented on a number of missed nappy collections, and the problems that this had presented for some local residents. An officer explained that the Council was working with Welsh Government to improve the reliability of collection schedules, and to roll out 'yellow nappy bins' across the city. The Committee welcomed this development.

Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 (17th February 2020)

The meeting on the 17th February 2020 gave Members the opportunity to scrutinise and comment on the Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 & Corporate Overview / Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023. The item was supported by the Cabinet Member for Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment; the Cabinet Member for Strategic Planning & Transport; the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance and officers from Resources, People & Communities and Planning, Transport & Environment Directorates. The purpose of the report was to provide Members with an opportunity to scrutinise the sections of the Council's Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023, and Draft Cabinet 2020/21 budget consultation proposals relevant to the terms of reference of the Committee.

Following discussion, questions and comments the Committee sent a letter to the Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance that included the following points:

Corporate Overview

- **Capital Borrowing Concerns** - During the meeting Members asked how sustainable the Council's proposed Capital Programme was over the next five years, and questioned the impact that this might have upon the wider revenue budget. The five year capital programme contained £938,875 million in proposals; much of which would need to be repaid by funds from the Council's revenue budget. An officer explained to the Committee that the current proposals had been assessed during the budget setting process, and that they were deemed both deliverable and affordable. Given the wider uncertainty and risk facing the United Kingdom economy, the Committee asked for assurance that the allocated capital budget was affordable.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

- **Staffing for Transport Projects** – A Member expressed concern that the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was reducing staff numbers at a time when the number of schemes coming through was increasing (particularly transport related). He was told that most of the capital funds for the new transport schemes would include provision for the temporary recruitment of staff to help deliver the projects. He and the Committee were satisfied by this answer, however, they asked for assurance that:
 - The Council would be able to recruit the required number of staff, with the appropriate skills, and within the necessary timescale to deliver the new transport schemes;
 - The Council would be able to employ suitably qualified staff on short term contracts to deliver the work, rather than have to rely on expensive consultants.

- **Cycle Parking Provision** – At the meeting a Member questioned why some of the cycle parking provision in the city centre was so poorly located, and asked what could be done to identify better sites in future. As an example, he referred to separate cycle parking facilities adjacent to Marks & Spencer and close to Miller & Carter – both in the city centre. The Committee asked if the Cabinet Member could:
 - Confirm the process that is used to identify suitable cycle parking facilities in Cardiff;
 - Provide details of any consultation that might take place prior to deciding on where to locate cycle parking.

- **Capital Allocation – Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (Cardiff Bus)** – Capital line 59 allocated £13.6million for Cardiff Bus across the financial years of 2020/21 and 2021/22. The budget line explained that the funding would be *'subject to a further report to and decision of Full*

Council, due diligence and other matters', with the ultimate aim of providing 'a package of support for Cardiff City Transport Services Limited'. The Committee was concerned by the amount of capital allocated to support Cardiff Bus over two years, and asked for regular updates as developments unfolded.

- **Moving Traffic & Attended Parking Enforcement Cameras** – Line 93 of the capital programme allocated £475,000 towards the installation of 'moving traffic cameras' and 'attended parking enforcement cameras' on new routes in the city centre. The Committee welcomed the introduction of the cameras in the city centre, particularly if they are used to target problem and illegal parking, for example, blocking of bus lanes. The Committee asked for confirmation of the routes that the new cameras were going to target, which offences they would prioritise and where they would be introduced.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

❖ Delivered by the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate

- **Flooding** – At the meeting reference was made to the recent flooding that had taken place and the impact that this had on local residents and the Council. Comments were also made about the growing threat of climate change, and the potential implications that this could have upon coastal and river flooding. The Committee asked for an explanation on what the Council was doing to mitigate all types of flood risk, the resources being allocated and any long term forward thinking that was taking place.

❖ Delivered by the People & Communities Directorate

- **New Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff** – Line 39 of the capital programme allocated £3.325 million across the financial years 2020/21, 2021/22 and 2022/23 for the provision of a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff. At the meeting it was explained to Members that creating such a site in the north of the city was still a

political commitment, however, the practicality of identifying a suitable site remained a challenge. The Committee was informed that work would continue to identify a suitable site, and that capital funding had been committed to the scheme. Members asked for a progress update on identifying a suitable scheme, to include details of sites that had been considered along with a realistic timescale for delivering the new facility.

- **Love Where You Live** – Members welcomed the additional £60,000 that had been included in the budget to help with the delivery of the revamped ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. They felt that the scheme was an excellent educational / awareness raising tool that encouraged volunteer participation and, therefore, provided excellent value for money. The wider budget allocated £4.446 million of new monies for dealing with the collection, removal and processing of waste; this was a huge amount of money when compared to the resources put towards the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. Members commented that improving how the Council managed waste and achieved cleaner streets was not just down to how it processed, collected and removed waste, it also involved raising awareness and better public education. Following on from this comment the Committee asked for:
 - Details of what the £60,000 for ‘Love Where You Live’ would provide, for example, staff, equipment, promotional budget, etc..;
 - An increase in the funding for ‘Love Where You Live’ as the scheme sends out a very positive message and engages with lots of volunteers providing excellent value for money.

SCRUTINY IMPACT 2019/20

During 2019/20 the Committee scrutinised a wide range of topics, and in doing so made a numerous comments, suggestions and recommendations. This section captures a selection of comments, suggestions and recommendations that Committee Members felt added value and impact during the municipal year:

❖ **22nd July – 2019 – Cardiff Food Strategy**

In July 2019 the Committee had an opportunity to scrutinise and make suggestions on the draft version of the 'Cardiff Food Strategy'. Members felt that the response to the July letter relating to the Cardiff Food Strategy was positive, and highlighted the following:

- **Local Food Market** – Members felt that Cardiff had a strong local food community, but lacked a permanent base where local food offers could be showcased. A Member pointed out that the city does not have an equivalent of Borough Market, and that such a facility would add sustainability, economic and tourism benefits. The Committee asked the Cabinet Member to look into this idea to establish if a suitable location existed in the city centre, and the feasibility of developing such a venue. The Cabinet Member agreed to look into the matter as a part of the development of the Food Strategy, and in doing so would work with key partners, for example, FOR Cardiff.

- **Council Food Establishments – Healthy Eating Options** – During the meeting comments were made on the lack of healthy food options at County Hall and other staff canteens. The Cabinet Member was asked what was being done to improve the healthy eating offer for staff, and to provide details of future healthy eating options to be introduced at County Hall and other Council food establishments. The Cabinet Member accepted this recommendation, and agreed to work with County Hall Canteen to drive improvements.

- **Local Food Quality Mark** - The Committee recommended the idea of creating a local food quality mark for Cardiff. They felt that this could be introduced to identify locally produced food that meets an agreed standard. Members commented that it would help local food growers, support the local economy and incentivise sustainability. The Committee encouraged the Cabinet Member to develop this idea in partnership with local food producers / retailers and the wider community. In response the Cabinet Member explained that local businesses and organisations had expressed an interest in developing local quality food mark, and so the strategy would work to deliver such a scheme as one of its aims.
- **Beef** - During the meeting a Member suggested that the Council should probably play a greater role in determining what was consumed at Council establishments and in school canteens. For example, beef, beef and beef had dominated the menu at his daughter's school for the last three days. He went on to highlight the current environmental crisis facing the planet, making reference to the negative impact that the beef industry has on large parts of the world. He continued by suggesting that the Council should use its influence in the procurement process to understand where beef came from, providing assurance that it was locally produced and not a product of Brazil where huge deforestation is taking place. The Committee agreed with this suggestion and encouraged the Council to produce a greener menu to support the Council's wider carbon reduction commitment, and to encourage schools to do more to promote healthy eating on the curriculum. The Cabinet Member accepted the recommendation and agreed to work with County Hall canteen to see where improvements could be made.

❖ **September 2019 – Biodiversity & Resilience of Ecosystems Duty**

During the spring and summer of 2019 the Environmental Scrutiny Committee carried out work on a task & finish exercise titled 'Managing Biodiversity & Natural Environment in Cardiff'. In advance of the publication of the report, and to align with Cabinet publication deadlines for the 'Biodiversity & Resilience of Ecosystems Duty', the Committee wrote a letter to the Cabinet

Member, setting out a number of comments, observations and suggestions around the draft document. Members were pleased with the overall response to the letter, and made particular reference to the following:

- The Committee letter dated 12th September 2019 endorsed the re-establishment of the Cardiff Biodiversity Partnership, it explained that, *'to support the delivery of the 'Cardiff Green Infrastructure Plan', the Members recommend that the Council should re-establish the Cardiff Biodiversity Partnership. This group could be tasked with overseeing the delivery of the projects contained within the 'Biodiversity & Resilience of Ecosystems Duty Action Plan', and could provide Cabinet with regular updates. Some Members felt that the title of the group could be changed to 'Partnership for Nature' to better define its purpose, and that the partnership could be chaired by a Council appointed nature and biodiversity champion'*.

Members were pleased with the Cabinet response which provided reasons why the Cardiff Biodiversity Partnership was unable to continue, but also highlighted that external funding had now been identified which would be used to employ a 'Biodiversity Officer', which would allow the 'Local Nature Partnership' to be progressed.

- The Committee letter explained that *'Section 3.3.4 of the 'Green Infrastructure Plan' makes reference to a various forms of green infrastructure and the mitigating impact that these can have against climate change; this includes an acknowledgement of the contribution that trees can make. Members support this, however, feel that the document should go further and highlight current and potential future policies that the Council can use to protect and enhance tree coverage in Cardiff'*. In response the Cabinet Member responded by explaining that 'Proposals for a Tree Strategy for Cardiff have yet to be set out in detail in the BRED Action Plan, but we recognise that this would be a valuable tool on the step towards an 'Urban Forest' or 'Canopy Cover' strategy. Increased tree coverage would align with climate change mitigation and adaptation, improving air quality and protecting biodiversity. It is therefore appropriate that this project is prioritised'.

❖ 21st January 2020 – Cabinet - Improving Cardiff's Air Quality

The Cabinet provided a response to the Committee report titled 'Improving Cardiff's Air Quality' at the meeting on the 21st January. Members were very pleased with the number of recommendations that were accepted, and the general positive reply to the report as a whole. They welcomed the comments that made by Councillor Wild during his opening statement, this thanked the Committee for the piece of work and the valuable contribution that it made. While the report made 31 recommendations, Members were of the view that the following made the biggest impact:

- **Recommendation 8** – The report recommended that the Planning Service reviewed its existing supplementary planning guidance in relation to managing air quality, and implementing sustainable fuel infrastructure alongside the development of the Clean Air Strategy. The Cabinet response accepted the recommendation, explaining that *'Shared Regulatory Services (SRS) have developed a draft version of a Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) for Cardiff Council. This document is subject to review and approval. In addition, the Planning Team have already produced a new SPG on the requirements for EV Infrastructure on new developments'*.

- **Recommendation 9** - The task group recommended a review into the wider traffic and pollution implications of new developments. They asked that this should include a review of traffic modelling techniques and how planning obligation monies can be applied across a wider area to deal with the impact of traffic and pollution. The recommendation was accepted, with the Cabinet response explaining that *'the implementation of this recommendation is dependent on the scale of the development, and any requirements for an Air Quality Assessment (AQA). SRS already request that cumulative impacts of large developments are considered when agreeing the scope of the AQA with developers/ consultants. SRS ensures that AQA comply the requirements of Institute of Air Quality Management (IAQM) /Environmental Protection UK (EPUK) Planning Guidance for AQ assessments. This will be further enhanced through a revised SPG on Air*

Quality. The use of planning obligation monies across wider areas can be considered but would be subject to agreement of local members agreeing wider expenditure’.

- **Recommendation 12** – The report recommended that the Council should increase its focus on the affordable short-term measures within its control. The recommendation was accepted, with the Cabinet response explaining that *‘current focus is on the Feasibility Study and developing and implementing the preferred option detailed in the Final Plan and agreed with Welsh Government. Additional measures including anti idling zones, green infrastructure/ Living walls can be taken forward as part of wider Clean Air Strategy but will of course be subject to appropriate funding being available’.*

- **Recommendation 17** – The report recommended that *‘the Council, public sector partners, major employers and For Cardiff (the Cardiff BID) should do all it can to encourage their staff to use active travel to get to work and carry out day to day trips whenever possible’.* The recommendation was accepted in the Cabinet response, and backed up with the following explanation, *‘working initially through Cardiff Public Services Board, a Healthy Travel Charter for Cardiff has been developed with major public sector employers’*, it continued by explaining that *‘signatories to the Charter make 14 commitments on improving access to active and sustainable travel for staff and visitors to their main sites, and jointly commit to three targets namely:*
 - *Reduce the proportion of commuting journeys made by car;*
 - *Increase the proportion of staff cycling weekly; and,*
 - *Increase the proportion of vehicles used for business purposes which are plug-in hybrid or electric.*

The Charter was signed by 11 public sector organisations employing over 33,000 staff, with additional public and private sector organisations subsequently invited to sign up to the Charter.

❖ **17th February 2020 - Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 & 2020/21 & Draft Cabinet Budget Proposals 2020/21**

The budget proposals for 2020/21 and draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 were scrutinised at the Committee meeting on the 17th February. Based on the Cabinet response to the letter produced after the meeting, and taking comments from the meeting and across the year Members felt that Scrutiny impact was achieved in the following areas:

- **Love Where You Live** – The budget proposals for 2020/21 included an additional £60,000 to support the revamp of the Love Where You Live campaign. This included £35,000 for a Community Development Coordinator, and £25,000 dedicated towards litter picking resources. The Committee welcomed the additional funding, as they recommended in the ‘Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff’ report that the Council should *‘increase the funding for ‘Love Where You Live’ as the scheme sends out a very positive message, and engages with lots of volunteers providing excellent value for money’*.
- **Cycle Parking Provision** – At the meeting a Member questioned why some of the cycle parking provision in the city centre was so poorly located, and asked what could be done to identify better sites in future. As an example he referred to separate cycle parking facilities adjacent to Marks & Spencer and close to Miller & Carter – both in the city centre. The Committee letter sent after the meeting to the Cabinet Member asked him to:
 - *Confirm the current process that is used to identify suitable cycle parking facilities in Cardiff, and,*
 - *Provide details of any consultation that might take place prior to deciding on where to locate cycle parking – Committee Members believe that the Council should identify a mechanism to consult with ‘everyday cyclists’ instead of relying on responses from established cycling groups.*

In his response the Cabinet Member '*acknowledging the current and fragmented nature of City Centre cycle parking*' and explained that to address the issue they had '*commissioned a short study to map both existing and future demand and align this with UK best practice. This assessment will report shortly and will identify future major cycle parking locations. This document will also be the basis of future consultation with Ward Councillors in order to optimise the approach and establish an agreed way forward*'.

❖ **3rd March 2020 – Cabinet Response – Environmental Scrutiny Committee Report Titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff'**

Members felt that the response to the Environmental Scrutiny Committee report titled 'Litter & Fly Tipping in Cardiff' was very positive. The Cabinet accepted 57 of the 68 recommendations, and partially accepted a further 10 recommendations contained within the report. They were also told that the document is now being used as the basis of an action plan to be used to address litter and fly tipping in the city. The key recommendations accepted in this report were:

- **Resource Allocation Based on Good Data** – The Committee recommended that the Council develop a robust data source that is constantly updated through a new integrated technology network. The Cabinet response agreed with this and staff in the service area are now developing '*a technology network capable of creating data visualisations*' which will help improve the allocation of resources in future.
- **Workforce Planning** – Members raised concerns about the average age of the street cleansing workforce and the physically demanding nature of the work they undertake. They felt that the older age profile had the potential to impact on sickness rates and medium to long term work succession planning. They recommended that the service fed this into the Council's wider workforce planning exercise. The Cabinet report accepted this exercise, and confirmed that work was underway to '*consider*

opportunities for the creation of apprenticeships in the service that will assist in addressing the issues identified'.

- **Community Protection Notices** – Newport City Council had some success in dealing with fast food related litter buy using Community Protection Notices. At the time of the report this was not something that was being used in Cardiff. Members recommended that the Council should review the option of applying this approach in Cardiff. This recommendation was accepted, with the Cabinet response agreeing to consider the approach, and look at how it might be used to tackle fast food litter in the city.
- **Refresh the ‘Love Where You Live’ Campaign** – Members recommended that the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign should be relaunched to help raise educational awareness, and that this should be supported by a number of new initiatives aimed at reducing litter and fly tipping. The Cabinet response accepted this recommendation, and to support the initiative allocated an additional £60,000 in the 2020/21 budget to help fund a Community Development Officers and other extra resources to support community litter picking.
- **Using Social Media to Deliver Targeted Measures** – Members recommended that the Council should use targeted social media messages to address litter and fly tipping problems in specific communities and geographical areas. The Cabinet response accepted this approach and agreed to pilot such *‘new approaches to tackling litter and fly tipping’*. They went on to explain that *‘targeted communications and education will support this initiative’*.
- **Volunteering** – The report made a series of recommendations on volunteering, which the Cabinet report accepted, these included:
 - Running an annual recognition ceremony to recognise the efforts of Cardiff’s volunteers.

- Providing funding for a 'Volunteer Co-ordinator Post', this was supported in the 2020/21 budget process by the addition of an extra £35,000 to cover this role.
- To support and grow the 'Cardiff Tidy Network', this would help to develop volunteer resources across Cardiff and help promote best practice.
- Providing storage space to support established volunteer groups.
- The provision of Council communications support for volunteer groups, to help raise their profile and to promote the good work that they do – this is now happening through Council social media channels.

RECOMMENDED FUTURE WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee receives regular work programme updates at which Members have the opportunity to consider items for inclusion on the work programme, and suggest any new issues that may be of interest to the Committee. The following items have been identified during 2019/20 as suitable items for discussion during the 2020/21 work programming process:

- Cardiff's Bus Routes & Services;
- Lamby Way Solar Farm – Member Update;
- Highways Resurfacing Programme;
- Fourth Cardiff Local Development Plan Annual Monitoring Report;
- Shared Regulatory Service Annual Report 2019/20 & Business Plan 2020/21;
- Recycling & Waste Management Strategy;
- Waste Collection Productivity;
- Recycling & Waste Management Service Restructure;
- Draft Budget Proposals 2021/22;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Quarterly Performance;
- Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate – Directorate Delivery Plan 2020/21;
- Planning, Transport & Environment – Improving Digitalisation;
- Cabinet Response to Scrutiny report Managing Biodiversity;
- Transport for Wales – South Wales Metro Update;
- Transport White Paper.

Scrutiny Services, City and County of Cardiff,

Room 263, County Hall, Atlantic Wharf, Cardiff. CF10 4UW

Tel: 029 2087 2953 Email: scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk

© 2020 City and County of Cardiff